

**MINUTES
CITY OF AMES
PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION**

Date: April 4, 2018	Matt Converse, Chairperson	2020
	Carlton Basmajian, Vice Chairperson	2020
Call to Order: 7:00 PM	Anuprit Minhas	2019
	Doug Ragaller	2019
Place: Ames City Hall Council Chambers	Mindy Bryngelson	2021
	Jon Emery	2021
Adjournment: 7:57 PM	Carol Spencer	2021
	[*Absent]	

MAJOR TOPICS DISCUSSED:

1. Ames Urban Fringe Plan Map Amendment for Timber Ridge
2. Major Site Development Plan Amendment for 3305 and 3315 Aurora Avenue
3. Annual Review of the Planning & Zoning Commission Bylaws

CALL TO ORDER: Matt Converse, Vice Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

MOTION: (Ragaller/Minhas) to approve the Agenda for the meeting of April 4, 2018.

MOTION PASSED: (7 - 0)

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MARCH 21, 2018:

MOTION: (Minhas/Emery) to approve the Minutes of the meeting of March 21, 2018.

MOTION PASSED: (7- 0)

PUBLIC FORUM: There were no public comments.

ELECTION OF OFFICERS:

MOTION: (Ragaller/Spencer) to nominate Matt Converse as Chairperson of the Planning and Zoning Commission. Matt Converse stated that he accepted the nomination.

MOTION PASSED: (7 - 0)

MOTION: (Minhas/none) to nominate Carlton Basmajian as Vice Chairperson of the Planning and Zoning Commission. Carlton Basmajian stated that he accepted the nomination.

MOTION PASSED: (6 - 1) (nay: Basmajian)

**PUBLIC HEARING FOR THE AMES URBAN FRINGE PLAN MAP AMENDMENT FOR
TIMBER RIDGE**

Justin Moore, Planner, stated that the City received an application to amend the Ames Urban Fringe Plan Map from the Story County Board of Supervisors. He stated that the Ames Urban Fringe is located immediately outside of the City limits and was approved subject to a 28E agreement between Story County, Gilbert and the City of Ames in 2006. Mr. Moore stated that tonight's request is to change the Land Use Map designation from Agriculture and Farm Service to Rural Residential for the four parcels under consideration. He stated that these four parcels were originally created by Plats of Survey in the 1990s. Mr. Moore reviewed the current zoning designation of the four parcels. He stated that the current property owners requested that the County subdivide each of the four parcels into a total of eight parcels. Mr. Moore stated that in February the Story County Board of Supervisors voted to approve the subdivision of the four original parcels to allow for the construction of four new residential homes. He stated that the 28E Agreement and the Ames Urban Fringe Plan requires that the request needs to be approved by the City of Ames. Mr. Moore stated that if this request is approved the property will have a Rural Residential land use designation. He reviewed the uses that are allowed under the Rural Residential land use designation. Mr. Moore stated that this area is not an area that the City desires to annex. He stated that urban services, utilities and infrastructure (such as roads) will not serve this area. Mr. Moore stated that the area will be served by rural utilities.

Carlton Basmajian asked if the current homes on this property were constructed before the Urban Fringe Plan identified the property Agriculture and Farm Services. Mr. Moore stated that he thinks that one of the homes may have been built after the adoption of the Ames Urban Fringe Plan. Mr. Basmajian asked why this area was not designated as Rural Residential at the time of adoption. Mr. Diekmann stated that current staff was not in place when the Ames Urban Fringe Plan was adopted. He stated that there are very few Rural Residential areas on the Ames Urban Fringe Plan map and that many minor rural settlements are in the Agriculture and Farm Services designation; however, further subdivision is not permitted. Mr. Basmajian asked if the subdivision could be created if the designation remained Agriculture and Farm Services. Mr. Diekmann stated that after visiting with the Planning Director from Story County the determination is that the creation of more home sites does not meet the expectation of the Agriculture and Farm Services designation. He reviewed why staff feels that the Rural Residential designation is a more appropriate designation. Mr. Diekmann stated that the Story County Board of Supervisors has already approved the Final Plat.

Mr. Basmajian asked if changing the land use designation to Rural Residential would make annexation easier. Mr. Diekmann stated that annexation can only occur in the Urban Service designation.

Mindy Bryngelson asked if the area to the north would remain Agriculture and Farm Services. Mr. Diekmann stated that that was correct.

Jerry Moore, Story County Planning & Development, stated that this request came about due to the submittal of the rural residential subdivision plats by property owner, Dickson Jensen. He stated that this property is zoned A1 Agricultural District. Mr. Moore stated that the most that can be done in the A1 Zone is to split each parcel one time for a new single family dwelling. He stated that none of the 75 acres of this area is currently in agricultural or livestock production. Mr. Moore reviewed the reasons why staff feels that the Rural Residential land use designation is appropriate for this property.

Jon Emery asked for clarification that the property can be divided just one time. Jerry Moore stated that that was correct. He stated that in order to do any additional divisions it would require a rezone of the property and approval from the City of Ames, City of Gilbert and Story County. Mr. Emery listed his concerns that the natural areas would be preserved and a potential turning lane off of Highway 69 to serve the additional homes would be added. Jerry Moore stated that it is a state road right-of-way and not under the jurisdiction of Story County.

MOTION: (Ragaller/Bryngelson) to accept Alternative #1, which states: that the Planning and Zoning Commission recommends that City Council approve a Minor Amendment to the Ames Urban Fringe Plan Land Use Framework Map from Agriculture and Farm Service to Rural Residential for the properties as requested by the applicant.

MOTION PASSED: (7- 0)

PUBLIC HEARING FOR THE MAJOR SITE DEVELOPMENT PLAN AMENDMENT FOR 3305 AND 3315 AURORA AVENUE

Ray Anderson, Planner, reviewed the location on a map of the two lots under consideration. He also reviewed the location of existing and proposed apartment buildings near this property. Mr. Anderson stated that in October 2017 two, eight-plex apartment buildings and two, eight stall garages, one behind each building, were approved to be constructed on this property. He stated that the property owner is requesting to change the exterior siding material to be used on each of the garages. Mr. Anderson stated that the applicant also wishes to change the dimensions of the two garages to allow for a handicap accessible stall in each garage. He stated that the property owner is also requesting to change the location of the trash enclosures. Mr. Anderson stated that galvalume finish corrugated metal siding was approved earlier for all four exterior sides of each of the garages. He described the style and types of materials to be used on the apartment buildings. Mr. Anderson stated that the property owner now wishes to use vinyl siding only on the exterior of the garages. He reviewed staff's recommendation.

Mr. Emery asked for clarification if the applicant wants to use just vinyl siding on the garages. Mr. Anderson stated that staff is okay with the property owner using vinyl siding; if, they also use a brick accent on the garages.

Ms. Bryngelson asked for clarification if the applicant had requested a change to use vinyl siding on both the building and the garage whether the request would still need to come back to the Commission. Mr. Anderson stated it still would have to go back to the City Council for the change. He reviewed the exterior materials used on the apartment buildings in the immediate area. Ms. Bryngelson asked if the 12-plex to the north of this property has garages that match the materials used on the main building. Mr. Anderson stated that it does.

Mr. Diekmann stated that it is not that vinyl siding is not approvable in Ames. He stated that it is because it is a Major Site Development Plan and a full change of building materials to something else is considered a change to the overall design.

Chuck Winkleblack, Hunziker Companies, 105 South 16th Street, stated that the main building was designed with horizontal siding. He stated that the new material is also horizontal and they feel that the materials are almost indistinguishable whether they are metal or vinyl. Mr. Winkleblack stated that the cost per building is almost \$15,000 more with the metal product. He

stated that it is basically a cost factor. Mr. Winkleblack stated that they don't feel that the metal product on the garage adds value that would require increasing the rent to cover the additional cost. He stated that due to ADA Code changes for garages, after the site plan was approved but before the garages were constructed, they needed to come back to the Commission.

Mr. Basmajian asked whether they no longer want to add the brick to the garages. Mr. Winkleblack stated that basically only the north side of the one garage is visible. He stated that they are opposed to adding the brick to the garages as they feel it does not add any inherent value.

Carol Spencer asked if staff's recommendation for adding the brick was because of aesthetics. Mr. Anderson stated that that was correct.

Ms. Bryngelson asked Mr. Winkleblack if they built the 12-plex apartment building to the north. Mr. Winkleblack stated that that building has not been constructed yet but the intended materials are the same.

Ms. Bryngelson stated that when she drove out to the site the garages in the area do reflect the same look as the buildings that they are associated with. She asked whether they feel that this new garage siding material will look the same as the siding on the apartment building after ten years. Mr. Winkleblack stated they have not used a lot of the metal product; and, he does not know how it will look after 10 years. He stated that they are long term holders of property; and, it is not their intention to not have them look good in the future.

Mr. Emery asked what the increase in cost of the original siding would add to the cost of the rent. Mr. Diekmann stated that there isn't a way to verify the increase. He stated that the staff recommendation is that the common way to treat accessory buildings is to include elements from the principal structure.

Mr. Anderson reviewed the design of the galvalume corrugated metal siding. He said that the wavy appearance of the galvalume siding is very noticeable.

Mr. Basmajian asked why staff suggested using the brick accent and did not insist on keeping the original metal siding. Mr. Diekmann stated that staff felt that with the tie in of brick accents the garage could be deemed to be compatible and consistent with the main building.

Ms. Minhas stated that she feels that it is time to focus on the design aspect of how apartment buildings look and how they fit in with the neighborhood. She stated that one of her concerns when the Commission reviewed the plans for the first building of this project was how they fit in with the neighborhood. Ms. Minhas stated that there are developable sites on the west that will likely be single-family housing. She stated at that time the Commission discussed architectural compatibility with the neighborhood. Ms. Minhas stated that the 12-plex may be what defines the design of the neighborhood. She asked that if you change the material used on the garage for these eight-plex buildings do you anticipate similar design changes for the 12-plex structures. Mr. Winkleblack stated potentially on the garage, not on the main building. He stated that after landscaping is placed and mature most people will not notice the difference. Mr. Winkleblack stated that as a compromise maybe a brick accent could be placed on the side of the garage that runs along Cottonwood Road. Ms. Minhas asked if a brick or design feature was added to the sides and the corners that face Cottonwood would this compromise be acceptable. Mr. Winkleblack stated that he doesn't agree with it but feels that it would be a reasonable compromise.

Discussion was held on a possible compromise and alternative.

Mr. Basmajian stated that he understands the spirit of what the applicant is saying. He stated that part of the design is being removed and being replaced with a cheaper material. Mr. Basmajian stated that the details do matter. He stated that in the spirit of compromise this is a reasonable alternative.

MOTION: (Minhas/Basmajian) to accept Alternative #1 which states: that the Planning and Zoning Commission recommends that the City Council approve the Major Site Development Plan Amendment for 3305 and 3315 Aurora Avenue to allow for the proposed revisions to the garage siding material, proposed changes to the dimensions of the structure, and the proposed locations for trash enclosures on each lot, with the following condition:

A. The garage at 3305 Aurora Avenue shall incorporate brick accents wrapping each of the north corners of the structure and the garage at 3315 Aurora Avenue shall incorporate brick accents wrapping each of the south corners of the structure. The final design is subject to approval by the Planning Division.

MOTION PASSED: (7- 0)

ANNUAL REVIEW OF PLANNING & ZONING COMMISSION BYLAWS

Discussion was held about the requirement of reviewing the Land Use Policy Plan every five years.

The Commission members did not request to have any changes made to the bylaws.

COMMISSION COMMENTS: The new Commission members were welcomed to the Commission.

STAFF COMMENTS: Mr. Diekmann reviewed the status of the adopted Downtown/Gateway Moratorium. He stated that staff will be reporting back to the City Council in April about allowed uses and non-conformities.

MOTION TO ADJOURN:

MOTION: (Ragaller/none) to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 7:57 PM.



Matt Converse, Chairperson
Planning & Zoning Commission



Lorrie Banks, Recording Secretary
Department of Planning & Housing